0801807

Education, immigration, integration! Perceptions of the impact of migration since the 2004 EU enlargement on education in Scotland

Presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the

degree of M.A. (Honours)

University of Glasgow

21st March 2013

Word count: 12012

Abstract

The 2004 enlargement of the European Union resulted in a high number of migrant workers arriving in Scotland from Central and Eastern Europe, particularly from Poland. Since the accession of Romania and Bulgaria in 2008, restrictions on migrant workers have meant that migration from these countries has been less dramatic; however some migration has taken place. This topic has received much media attention, including in the educational press, yet the impacts of EU migration on provision of education services remains under researched. This study takes a qualitative look at this issue from the perspective both the educational media and of people working in schools and colleges, in order to establish how the issue is presented, perceived, and experienced.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr Jan Čulík for giving me the space I needed and support that I wanted while I was researching, and for always being willing to talk! Also, many thanks to the staff at Central & East European Studies and Slavonic Studies for keeping me inspired throughout my course, especially Dr Elwira Grossman, Dr John Bates, Marta Bequet, Hana Tomšů, Professor David Smith, Dr Ola Dąbowska, and Dr Moya Flynn – your support, encouragement and patience has meant a lot. To my flatmates, Claire and Jack – thanks for the room and the peanut butter; to my mum and Barney – thanks for everything, especially the peanut butter; to Craig – thank you for the constant reminders to get on with my dissertation. They would have been better received with some peanut butter, though. Eternal gratitude to Amy and Marc for correcting my shameful spelling errors! Finally, a huge "thank you" to everyone who agreed to be interviewed for this project - it would not have been possible without your willingness to share your time and thoughts and I am extremely grateful to you all!

Contents

Chapter 4: Interviews & Discussion

4.1 Language

4.2 Expectations

4.3 Resources

4.4 Training

4.5 Culture & Integration

4.6 Attitudes

4.7 Benefits

4.8 Summary

Conclusions & Recommendations

Bibliography

Apendices:

Appendix 1: Plain Language Statement

Appendix 2: Consent form

Appendix 3: Interview guide

Appendix 4: Interview Sample

Appendix 5: Ethics Committee Approval

Introduction

This project aims to uncover how teachers and the educational press perceive the impact that increased migration following the A8 and A2 enlargements[1] of the European Union have had on education in Scotland. It explores how those working in education believe migration from Eastern & Central European[2] states has affected the provision of education services in Scotland.

As well as a review of the relevant legislation and literature, a critical discourse analysis of articles in the educational press was also carried out in order to establish some of the ways in which perceptions of migration, migrants and their impact on UK society and the provision of public services such as education in the UK are constructed in the educational media. Teachers from Glasgow and the surrounding area were then interviewed in order to obtain in depth information about how individual practitioners across a range of sectors perceive and respond to the challenges and opportunities that have emerged as a result of the increase in migration to Scotland following EU enlargement.

. This study provides a unique perspective, as unlike other research that has been conducted on the experience of migrant children in schools, it focuses on the media and the views of education service providers rather than end users. It reveals what teachers see as the strengths and weaknesses of provision for migrant children from ECE in a number of areas including: English as an Additional Language (EAL) Support; ensuring access to the curriculum; integration into the school and the wider community; and encouraging the use of pupils' mother tongue(s) in school. The views of those interviewed are contrasted with the depiction of the issue in the educational press, establishing some of the ways in which perceptions of the impact of A8 and A2 migration on Scottish education are constructed and expressed.

---

[1] The term "A8 enlargement" describes the 2004 accession of Poland, Hungary, the Czech Republic, Slovakia, Estonia, Latvia, and Lithuania to the European Union, known as the A8 or Accession 8 states. The term "A2 enlargement" refers to the 2007 expansion of the EU to include Bulgaria & Romania – the "A2" or Accession 2 states.

[2] East & Central European states (or ECE states) refers in this context to those former communist countries which joined the European Union in the Accession 8 and Accession 2 enlargements.

Chapter 1

Literature Review

1.1 Defining the EU migrant child

The term "migrant" is a broad category, which can include migrant workers, asylum seekers, and illegal/undocumented migrants. A migrant child can similarly be defined in such broad terms as 'anyone under the age of 18, who was born outside the UK and is now residing in the UK' (Reynolds 2008: 3). However, a more specific concept of the "EU migrant child" is required for the purpose of this study.

The term "EU migrant child" will be used to refer to those children who have moved from one EU member state to another, usually as the child of a migrant worker, i.e. 'someone who arrives in a host country to do a particular job or with the intention of finding paid employment' (Speaking Out 2008: 2-3), and whose right to do so is enshrined by Article 45 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union. The extension of the rights of the EU migrant worker are extended to the EU migrant child under Directive 2004/38/EC, which provides for "The right of all Union citizens to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States should, if it is to be exercised under objective conditions of freedom and dignity, be also granted to their family members, irrespective of nationality." This definition of the "EU migrant child" is not unproblematic, as Ackers points out, due to the fact that it locates the rights of the child "within the framework of their parents' or families' rights" (Ackers 2004: 5). However, as this is the context within which their entitlement to education while domiciled in Scotland derives, this is the definition which will be used throughout this paper.

1.2 The Legislative Framework for the Education of EU Migrant Children in Scottish Schools

Education has been specified as a basic human right since 1946 under article 26 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. This right was extended in articles 28 & 29 of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child which

requires, among other things, that: "States Parties shall promote and encourage international cooperation in matters relating to education" (28:3), and that a child's education should be directed towards "The development of respect for the child's parents, his or her own cultural identity, language and values, for the national values of the country in which the child is living, the country from which he or she may originate, and for civilizations different from his or her own." (29:1 (c)). The spirit of this declaration became enshrined in Scots law with the Standards in Scotland's Schools Act (2000), which requires local authorities to provide all children with education that "is directed to the development of the personality, talents and mental and physical abilities of the child or young person to their fullest potential."

The legal right of EU migrant children to access education in the host state on the same terms as a citizen of that state was established in 1968 in article 12 of EC regulation 1612/68, which states "The children of a national of a Member State who is or has been employed in the territory of another Member State shall be admitted to that State's general educational, apprenticeship and vocational training courses under the same conditions as the nationals of that State, if such children are residing in its territory." It also provided that "Member States shall encourage all efforts to enable such children to attend these courses under the best possible conditions." How to create these "best possible conditions" was a new challenge for member states that was often ignored, perhaps due to the vague wording of the regulation itself and the fact that it did not place any specific demands on the host states – the principle of subsidiarity in the EU directing that its implementation be left to individual member states' discretion (Sbragia & Stolfi 2008: 121).

This was to some extent addressed by EC directive 77/486, which required that: "in order to permit the integration of such children into the educational environment and the school system of the host State, they should be able to receive suitable tuition including teaching of the language of the host State; . . . host Member States should also take, in conjunction with the Member States of origin, appropriate measures to promote the teaching of the mother tongue and of the culture of the country of origin of the above mentioned children, with a view principally to facilitating their possible reintegration into the Member State of origin." The extent to which this actually took place is explored in some detail by

Ackers & Stalford (2004), and concludes that even prior to enlargement, provisions for the children moving within the EU were "patchwork" in nature (Ackers & Stalford 2004: 279). However, it is important to point out that this directive demonstrates awareness at the level of EU institutions of the potential difficulties faced by the children of migrant workers taking advantage of their right to free movement throughout the EU.

The right of *all* children attending schools in Scotland to additional support to enable them, regardless of their background, to access the curriculum did not become law until 2004. The Education Scotland Act 1980 specifically excluded being taught in a language other than the child's mother tongue from the category of "special educational needs" that were entitled to support. The contradiction inherent in this was that while it recognises that having a different first language may act as a barrier to accessing education, it absolved local authorities and schools of the responsibility of removing that barrier for the benefit of pupils. This was resolved by the Education Scotland (Additional Support for Learning) Act 2004, which expands the definition of those pupils who were entitled to additional support to: "A child or young person has additional support needs for the purposes of this Act where, for whatever reason, the child or young person is, or is likely to be, unable without the provision of additional support to benefit from school education provided or to be provided for the child or young person." This includes pupils who do not have English as a first language. Prior to this Act, there was no legal obligation in Scots law to provide migrant children or those with English as an additional language with additional support.

This contradiction, and any possible conflict of Scots law with EC directive 77/486 was removed with the enactment of the 2004 Act. The legislative framework is now in place to give all pupils access to the curriculum, with support as required. However, there has been doubt expressed in the media (Seith 2007) about the capacity of schools to provide support for all learners who require it.   These doubts were based on additional pressures faced by schools following an increase in the number of migrant children from Central and Eastern Europe, who arrived following the A8 enlargement of the EU in the year the act came into force.

1.3 Migration to Scotland following 2004 and its impact on education services

The impact of EU enlargement on education in the UK has become progressively more widely acknowledged and researched since 2004. The effects of EU enlargement were at first discussed primarily in economic terms, but over time more research has been conducted into the socio-economic and social aspects of migration from new EU member states to the EU. The trend has also been for the research to become more focused on particular groups.

The pre-accession reports by the Scottish government, such as *The Benefits and Threats of EU Enlargement for Scotland* (Zuleeg, 2002) and *Report on the enlargement of the European Union and the challenges and opportunities facing Scotland* (Scottish Executive, 2002) outline the Scottish government's assessment of the likely economic impact of EU enlargement in 2004. Overall they are very positive about the potential economic, cultural and civic benefits to Scotland, emphasising existing links between Scotland and the A8 candidate countries, but the former points out that "large scale migration to the West could become a distinct problem." However, it does not go into detail about what these problems might include and does not consider any potential impact on public services or education. The latter report does not discuss at all any possible increase in migration and the effects of this on public services, but emphasises that "It is very important that the public, private and voluntary sectors in Scotland are aware of this major development and that they prepare to take advantage of the opportunities and are alert to the challenges it presents.", but is vague about what these might be. No pre-accession literature that specifically considers the potential pressure placed on schools and education services due to EU enlargement has been found.

A post-accession (2009) report from the Scottish government, *Recent Migration to Scotland: the Evidence Base* acknowledges that "there has been very little research into the impact of migration on education [in Scotland]" but that there exists some evidence that there has been an increase in demand for English language tuition in order to enable pupils to access the curriculum. This report gathers its evidence from a review of the existing literature, none of which focuses directly on the impact of A8 or A2 migrant pupils in Scottish schools, but either draws on a wider UK context or the experiences of specific migrant groups (such as Roma or asylum seekers) in accessing education. It is interesting to note at this juncture that this increase in demand for bilingual support coincides with the reconfiguration of English as an Additional Language services in Glasgow, a major destination for

incoming migrants to Scotland, which if implemented would lead to the closure of the only dedicated bilingual support unit. This has caused considerable concern among migration support groups and has been described as an "act of educational vandalism" (Barry 2011).

The vast majority of the primary research into the impacts of migration to Scotland from Central and Eastern Europe since the accessions has focused on the experiences of the most economically active migrant groups, such as studies on migrant workers in particular locations, or on those who have experienced most problems as a result of their migrant status. Access to education and issues pertaining to children and young people tend to form a small subsection of these studies, rather than be the main focus.

1.4 Previous studies on EU migration and education in the UK

Of the existing research into the experiences of migrant children in schools that has emerged, the majority consists of small scale case studies into particular schools in England. Often, there is no particular focus on migrants from Central and Eastern Europe (Reynolds 2008, Kumari 2009), although they are included in the studies. These studies also seek to apply to a wider UK context although they refer only to the English education system (either due to the small scale nature of the studies, or due to practical reasons) (Roma Education Fund 2011). It is important at this stage to note that although there are similarities between the English and Scottish school systems, the systems are not the same. Some larger scale research into the experiences of "newly arrived" migrant children has been conducted by HMIE, which assesses the measures taken by schools across Scotland using a mixture of surveys, interviews and informal discussions with staff, pupils and parents. This report includes data on supporting all newly arrived students (not only those from the new EU member states), and includes both primary and secondary schools.

All of these studies report a mixture of positive aspects of how schools dealt with ethnically diverse populations, but also clearly indicated areas for improvement. The most frequently noted positive aspects were the support provided for pupils, especially from specialist support staff and the inclusive ethos of the schools. Areas for improvement included the better integration of migrant pupils outside of their own

ethnic or linguistic groups, and the need for teachers to be culturally sensitive and aware of their students' diverse backgrounds. Increasing pressure on ESL and bilingual support services was observed. Moskal (2010) also notes that while Scottish schools were very welcoming to students from Poland, they were often seen by pupils and their parents as less academically rigorous than their Polish equivalents.

The distinct experiences and needs of the Roma communities were expressed by Reynolds (2008), and are expanded upon in a study by the Roma Education fund. Their situation upon arrival in UK schools is often very different from those of their other A8 peers, due to the still common practice of *de facto* segregation of Roma in Czech and Slovak schools, or their placement in "special schools" for those with learning disabilities. This study covers a wide geographical area in England, and reports very positively on the experiences of Roma pupils in UK schools, where the vast majority appeared to be coping well with mainstream education. This research took a different approach to the other studies, as it aimed to discern the impact of the UK education system on Roma pupils rather than the other way around, and to compare their education to what they had experienced in Slovakia and the Czech Republic.

There is a paucity of literature regarding the experience of A2 migrants in schools, with the slight exception of those who are part of Roma communities. This is a gap that should be addressed, as due to the labour market restrictions placed on this group, their experiences (and therefore those of their children) may differ significantly from those of A8 migrants.

By far the most extensive research into the experiences of migrant children from Eastern Europe has been by Syme *et al.* 2010. This large scale project looked qualitatively at many aspects of the lives of migrant children and from a range of perspectives, including from the children themselves, their parents, families and teachers. The recommendations made therein helped to inform this project, as it recognises that "School was the key service children used and the quality of their school experience strongly influenced how children perceived their whole experience after migration." It recommends that schools should have information on other European Education systems, "support or provision of specialist subjects in children's own language", and specialist bilingual support where possible. One of the aims of this project is to discover whether the teachers interviewed felt that these

were thought to be helpful or attainable goals for their working lives.

Prior to EU enlargement, the implications for Scotland and the UK were seen to be chiefly economic and political. However, the influx of migration that followed had wider social implications and impacted on a variety of aspects of life, including education. The minimal primary research that has been conducted in this area has generally been small scale, with the exception of the *At Home Abroad* project. It has also frequently included other groups of migrants from outside of the EU, including refugees and asylum seekers. There exists a tendency to generalise the "UK" education system, when in fact it is made up of four distinct systems, with Scotland perhaps being the most distinct (as it is not based on any variation of the National Curriculum, but has its own system). There is difficulty in obtaining accurate figures for migrants from A8 countries, and in all cases estimates are used. The lack of information regarding A2 migrants may reflect that, due to restrictions on their work, they are not yet economically "interesting" enough to attract attention. They also represent a much smaller proportion of migrants compared to the A8 influx. Nevertheless, migrant children from this group are entitled to the same education as any other children, native or migrant, and their experiences are worth studying. One of the aims of this project is to establish whether any lessons learned by schools after the A8 enlargement have been applicable to this group, or if they represent new challenges.

1.5 A8 migration and the press in Scotland

The importance of the media in constructing social phenomena is becoming ever more widely recognised. Croteu & Hoynes point out that "media images do not simply reflect the world, they re-present it" (1997: 171) Therefore, the media, as the main (or sometimes only) source of information people have about migrants (BEMIS 2011: 2), plays a key role in building public perceptions of the impact of migration on Scottish society. There has been some research conducted into the role of the media in the debate about the impact of EU migration from Central & Eastern Europe in Scotland. The Scottish press has generally been seen as more positive about the impact of migration - both generally and as a result of EU enlargement – than the rest of the UK press, but Migrants' Rights Network caution that "this should not be taken to mean that Scottish media coverage is generally positive on immigration."

(Migrants' Rights Network 2011: 9). Nevertheless, there does not seem to be evidence to suggest an "openly negative" campaign against EU migrants in the Scottish press – on the contrary, the "Vast majority of articles showed the A8 migrants as hardworking people who come to Scotland to find better lives and fill in the country's employment gap." (BEMIS 2011: 2 & 3). However, there has been no research to date into the particular role of the educational media in Scotland in this debate, which this project will address by analysing a selection of articles from the *Times Educational Supplement Scotland*, a newspaper supplement aimed at education professionals.

Chapter 2

Methodology

2.1 Research Questions

This dissertation addresses the following research questions:

How is the impact of migration from Central or Eastern Europe depicted in the educational press?

> By qualitatively analysing a selection of articles from the *Times Educational Supplement Scotland*, the research examines some of the ways in which the impact of EU migration since the A8 accession is constructed in the media.

What do teachers feel are the main challenges presented to them by migration as a result of EU enlargement?

> This section draws on the experiences of teachers to find out what problems they have experienced in communicating with children from Central and Eastern Europe, and whether there are problems which extend beyond language barriers.

To what extent do teachers feel that they are able to provide an appropriate education for all pupils, including migrant pupils from Central and Eastern Europe?

> With article 29 of the UNCRC in mind, this part explores how aware teachers are of their duty to provide education which fosters "the development of respect for the child's parents, his or her own cultural identity, language and values, for the national values of the country in which the child is living, the country from which he or she may originate, and for civilizations different from his or her own", and how successful they feel they are in doing so.

What do are seen as the actual and potential benefits of EU migration from Central and Eastern Europe to Scotland and Scottish education?

> Again, this section draws upon the experiences of teachers to find out what actual and potential benefits they have seen in EU migration from Central and Eastern Europe, and the barriers to obtaining these benefits.

This research is limited to analysing the experiences and perspectives of the media and of adults working in schools, due to the potential difficulty of obtaining ethical approval to work with vulnerable groups, such as children and teenagers. However, this provides an opportunity to gain insight into the attitudes and experiences of teachers who work with migrant children, thus hopefully being able to explain the some of the practices involved in their education based on educational theories and institutional constraints. It will offer a fresh perspective from much of the other research that has been conducted into the experiences of migrant children in UK schools, which has tended to focus on evidence provided by migrant children and their parents/carers (see. Syme. D. 2010; Reynolds; G. 2008; Roma Education Fund, 2011).

2.2 Ontological and epistemological considerations

This is a quantitative study based on an interpretivist epistemology, which is perhaps best described in negative terms in relation to its epistemological counterpoint, positivism. Positivism "advocates the application of the methods of the natural sciences to the study of social reality and beyond." (Bryman 2008: 697) In other words: that it should be objective; that its methods should be replicable; and that knowledge should be able to be confirmed by the senses. Interpretivism, on the other hand, "requires the social scientist to grasp the subjective meaning of social action" (Bryman 2008: 692). An interpretive epistemological approach is appropriate to this research, as it does not seek to generate generalizable data or prove any particular hypothesis, but rather takes an inductive approach where a number of aspects of how teachers perceive the impact of EU migration are explored, while any theory is generated *after* the data has been collected and analysed.

The ontological position of the researcher in this case is constructivist – i.e. working on the assumption that there is no objective social reality, but rather that "social phenomena and their meanings are continually being accomplished by social actors" (Bryman 2008: 19). This is an anti-realist position in which the researcher considers "the ways in which social reality is an ongoing accomplishment of social actors rather than something external to them and that totally constrains them (Bryman 2008: 20). The implication of this stance for this project is that it presumes

that the social actors - in this case teachers - have a crucial role to play in shaping the impact of EU migration from Central and Eastern Europe in Scottish schools through their attitudes and actions in relation to migrant pupils.

There is an apparent paradox inherent in this approach, however – namely that the interpretivist approach entails a "double interpretation" in which the researcher "is providing an interpretation of others' interpretation" (Bryman 2008:17), which could impact on the overall credibility of the conclusions. In order to minimise this effect, the researcher has made every attempt to sustain a high measure of reflexive awareness in conducting and writing up of this study, acknowledging that "[t]he researcher is viewed as implicated in the construction of knowledge through the stance that he or she assumes in relation to the observed and through the ways in which an account is transmitted in the form of a text" (Bryman 2008: 682).

2.3 Ethical considerations

Working with human subjects requires sensitivity and care for the subjects' safety and privacy. One of the major ethical considerations in such cases is that of informed consent. This was established through providing a Plain Language Statement (Appendix 1) to all participants, which outlined the nature and purpose of the research. After having time to read this and ask any questions, participants were then asked to sign an Interview Consent Form (Appendix 2) prior to the interview taking place.

In order to protect participants' privacy, all data collected (written or recorded) for the purpose of this project was stored on a password protected computer. The data gathered has been anonymised as far as possible – participants are identified by a code which is related only to their sector and length of experience. The names of schools referred to have also been redacted.

In conducting the research, it was important for me to maintain an awareness of my own position as a former teacher, and also as a student of Slavonic Languages, taking care that this did not bias my approach. However, I felt that my insider knowledge of the teaching profession gave me some advantage, as I am aware of the pressures that teachers face and was able to empathise with participants. This helped to build trust and had an overall positive effect on the quality of data gathered from interviews. However, the "researcher effect" – where

the subjective position of the researcher impacts on the design, conduct, and reporting of results - cannot be ignored.

The initial design of this project was approved by the College of Social Sciences Ethics Committee at the University of Glasgow.

2.4 Research design and procedure

This research project is comprised of two parts: qualitative media analysis and semi-structured interviews. The combination of these two methods of collecting data on how the impact of East European migration on Scottish schools is perceived enables the researcher to place the data generated from the interviews into the context of the wider, ongoing debate about migration and education in Scotland. The inclusion of media analysis was decided upon, as media reportage of the issue of Eastern European migration to Scotland was a key factor in provoking the researcher's interest in the topic.

2.4.1 Practical issues

Initially, the researcher had intended to undertake a case study of a particular school which had a high proportion of migrant pupils. However, there were difficulties in arranging this, largely due to the timing of the research; Scottish schools are currently undergoing a major overhaul of the curriculum, as the "Curriculum for Excellence" is launched, which has increased (hopefully temporarily!) the workload of all school staff in the country. It was decided that placing a student researcher into a school even for a short period was an extra burden that could not be justified ethically for research of this scale. Instead, the research was redesigned as outlined above. Surveys were also removed from the research design, as whilst they would have provided a broad overview of the issues raised by EU migration, it was decided that the richness of data gathered through interviews would be more valuable for research of this nature and scale.

2.4.2 Media analysis

The constructivist approach of the research recognises media discourse as an important feature in constructing the perception of the impact of EU migrant children

in Central and Eastern Europe on Scottish Education. Three articles on this topic were selected for analysis from the *Times Educational Supplement Scotland*, which was selected due to its regional specificity (pertains only to Scottish education) and its target readership (education professionals). The articles analysed were selected by searching for archived articles on the TES website dating from 2004 and using the search term "Eastern European", Boolean operator "+", and "migrant". When the results were filtered to the Scottish section, the TESS, there were three relevant articles for analysis. The resultant selection was "New kids from the bloc" (Macleod 2008), "Language support at breaking point" (Seith 2007) and "A case of 'sink or swim'" (Hepburn 2008). The analysis here looks for underlying themes in the texts, how they are conveyed, and how the articles create a perception of the impact of EU migration on Scottish education.

2.4.3 Interviews

Qualitative, semi-structured interviews were carried out with a non-probability sample of five teachers and student teachers from a range of backgrounds, experience levels and sectors.   The sampling method used was convenience sampling, i.e. "a sample that was selected because of its availability to the researcher" (Bryman 2008: 692) - in this case a selection of teachers that the researcher had trained or worked with and with whom a good enough relationship had been sustained that they were willing to share their experiences and thoughts for this project. The only criteria for participation was that participants must have had experience of working in a school in Glasgow or any of the surrounding local authorities since 2004.This sample, while in no way representative of the teaching population as a whole, did allow for a broad range of experiences of and attitudes towards the impact of EU migration to be explored in depth. The non-representativeness of the sample was not considered to be a problem given the qualitative nature of the research.

The participants were contacted via email and invited to take part in the research. The email included the Plain Language Statement and Consent form (Appendices 1&2), and participants were asked to contact the researcher with a suitable time and location for the interview to take place. All interviews were conducted in fairly neutral locations, such as cafes or coffee shops, according to the preference of the interviewee, in the late afternoon or early evening.   At the beginning of the interviews, participants were reminded of their rights to anonymity,

confidentiality and their right to withdraw at any time. The interview schedule (Appendix 3) was used as a guide, but interviewees were encouraged to talk about anything related to the topic of migration and education, and allowed to illustrate with their own experiences if they wished. However, the initial questions as outlined in the schedule were deliberately broad in scope and subjective – asking how participants felt about certain aspects of the issue. This allowed for a more personal style of response and more insight into how the teachers interviewed view the impact of EU migration on education without them worrying about giving "wrong" or "politically incorrect" responses. This was crucial, as this project is focused on exploring their perceptions of the issue of EU migration on education, rather than pointing out the problems that it causes on a practical level.

2.4.4 Coding

In order to interpret the data from both the media analysis and interviews, the data collected was coded, based on a grounded theory approach to the generation of theory out of the data contained in the primary sources. Grounded theory "aims to generate theory out of research data by achieving a close fit between the two" (Bryman 2008: 694). This was achieved by assigning codes to all of the themes raised in the media articles and interviews, which were refined into categories. Codes in qualitative research are used to "*Label, separate, compile* and *organize* data" (Charmaz 1983: 186, cited in Bryman 2008: 542). As a result of this process, different categories emerged from the press articles and the interviews, although there was a significant amount of overlap. The data related to these codes will be discussed in relation to the research questions outlined above. In each case, the language used in the discussion of these themes will be analysed alongside the content. This represents a combination of a qualitative content analysis approach, which emphasises emergence of categories from the data (Bryman 2008: 697), with discourse analysis, which recognises the role of language in constructing the social world (Bryman 2008: 500). The theory generated by the research is substantive in nature - i.e. relating to this particular empirical instance (perceptions of the impact of EU migration from Central and Eastern Europe) rather than a more generalizable formal theory (Bryman 2008: 544).

Chapter 3

Media Analysis

The articles selected for analysis all present the impact of migration from Central & Eastern Europe and have several aspects in common: each of them mainly used quotations from education professionals to illustrate the impact of A8 migration on education; all of them cite numbers or percentages of A8 migrants to support their claims; and all of them refer to language barriers or ability in English as a major issue for schools and colleges. However, they differ in their levels of positivity regarding the impact of A8 migration and the ways in which it is conveyed. The underlying themes that ran through all of them were established as a result of the coding process. The descriptive codes assigned to them were: *scale of migration* and *resource availability*; alongside the value code *attitudes*. Other themes that emerged(such as language barriers and inclusion), were all discussed in relation to resources, so will be discussed here under that heading. This analysis seeks to reveal how these themes are conveyed in the main educational newspaper in Scotland in order to establish how the perception of the impact of EU migration on Scottish Education is constructed.

3.1 Scale of Migration

All three articles emphasised that the scale and unexpectedness of migration from the A8 accession states and the numbers participating in education. MacLeod's article, "New Kids from the Bloc", is focused on the further education sector, which unlike primary and secondary schooling is voluntary and students must apply for places and are admitted on merit. Nevertheless, the article begins by dramatically introducing the topic with the sub-headline "Swathes of students from Eastern Europe are studying in Scottish colleges", going on to refer to "An influx of Eastern European students", and a "fivefold" increase in students from A8 countries. Readers are then warned of new "swathes" arriving from Latvia and Lithuania. Such language in referring to the numbers of students from A8 countries is reminiscent of the inflammatory "floods of immigrants" language of the tabloids and is effective in

detracting from the figures given in the article, which state that there were in fact 406 students in further education in Scotland, where there are more than 30 FE colleges. A large number and significant increase, but hardly justifies being described as an "influx" by "swathes" of migrants.

With reference to the primary and secondary sectors, in "Language Support at Breaking Point" Seith points to one local authority (Aberdeenshire), where "the pupils requiring support from the English as an Additional Language service more than doubled between August 2005 and September 2006" and gives examples of two primary schools (Peterhead Central and Fraserburgh North) in which "more than a quarter of pupils are from countries such as Poland and Lithuania". Seith then goes on to refer to the "influx of immigrants from Eastern Europe to Scotland", before going on to describe the rural towns of Peterhead, Fraserburgh and Stonehaven as being "swollen by migrants". Again, emotive language is used to emphasise the large numbers of arrivals, although in this case the relevant (albeit vague) numbers are given first, which somewhat offsets its impact.

The most recent of the articles considered here "A Case of Sink or Swim" also refers in its opening lines to the sharp increase in numbers of migrant pupils as an "influx", declaring that "Without adequate support, teachers struggle to keep afloat as number of migrant pupils swells". This article uses the most accurate data available from the time on the numbers of migrant pupils gathered by HMIE (Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education), highlighting instances where numbers of migrants "more than doubled". It also reports "In nine authorities which returned detailed information, the total rose by 61 per cent, from 1,656 to 2,668" – a significant increase, certainly, but spread across nine authorities. If this difference were evenly spread, that would total just over 112 migrant pupils in each of those authorities. However, this is unlikely to be the case, as some authorities experience more arrivals than others. It is not made clear what proportion of these new arrivals came from A8 countries (the HMIE report on which the article is based did not ask for country of origin of new arrivals), however, it is made clear that the increase is in a large part due to migrants from "new EU countries, such as Poland" arriving "in numbers". An interesting point made in this article relates specifically to A8 migrant pupils: that they are more difficult to accommodate at local authority level "perhaps because of their unpredictable numbers". This instability in numbers in this particular

group is depicted as much of a challenge as their overall numbers.

3.2 Resource availability

Pressure on resources is the central theme of all three articles from the TESS, in particular on language support services. MacLeod's article warns of potential "overcrowding", pointing to the number of ESOL students at Dundee College rising by 165 as evidence, but from the college's point of view, the problems did not appear to be to do with language. The depute principal is quoted as saying "'the biggest change we've had is to provide a lot of additional support. They come with a different type of problem - they don't have the usual support network and it's putting a strain on our resources'", indicating that pastoral care for migrant students is at least as much of a concern as language support; this is possibly due to the fact that many of the migrants are accessing dedicated ESOL courses as opposed to a school curriculum. While this article begins by highlighting potential pressure on resources in the further education sector as a result of A8 migration, this appears to be offset by the increase in funding which greater enrolments bring to the colleges - "Dundee, like other colleges, welcomes the additional cash the extra students bring". The article ends in far less dramatic fashion than it begins, pointing out that the number of migrants "fit in with the Fresh Talent initiative, which was introduced by the executive two years ago to encourage people to come and live in Scotland amid predictions of population decline". The contrast between the stark warning at the beginning of the article and its upbeat conclusion do not give the impression of a balanced report; on the contrary it appears that the article seeks to depict one problem – potential "overcrowding" – when in fact the problem lies in the lack of pastoral support FE colleges are able to provide for migrant students.

In the article "Language support at breaking point", the burden of providing adequate support for migrant pupils who require language support is communicated in no uncertain terms. Seith focuses on Aberdeenshire - "one of Scotland's most rural councils", and perhaps a surprising destination for migrants, as "When thinking about Peterhead, Fraserburgh and Stonehaven, diverse, multicultural communities are hardly what spring to mind" - thus emphasising the need for extra language support even where it may not be expected to be needed on a large scale. Before

outlining the scale migration to the area as outlines above, Seith emphasises the stress on Services in the headline "Language support at breaking point", an image suggesting unbearable pressure that could lead to the collapse of the EAL support system in the area. This metaphor is continued into the migration is "piling pressure on the language support service where staffing levels have remained static for years". The key issue set out here – that there has been no increase in service provision in proportion to the numbers entitled to that service – is portrayed as a situation that if allowed to continue will lead to a breakdown in the ability of the service to provide for those who need it. This is echoed in slightly less emphatic terms in a quotation from the head of EAL services Aberdeenshire who says "'We are very, very stretched and very, very thin . . . but there is no additional funding anywhere".   It is pointed out that although a Polish speaking EAL teacher was taken on, this was a serendipitous consequence of a vacancy arising, and it is stressed that the EAL head "still has only six EAL teachers on her staff the same number as six years ago". The consequence of this as described in the article is that whilst "'every child referred is seen and assessed'", not all will receive the support that they are entitled to because low levels of staffing mean that they "'have to prioritise'". This anecdotal evidence effectively illustrates the pressure on EAL services, even in areas that are did not traditionally attract large numbers of immigrants.

Hepburn's article underlines the impact of the gap between service provision and demand, stating that "Scottish schools are struggling to cope with the recent influx of migrant pupils and badly need more help from government and local authorities". The effect of this is shown to be a failure to meet the needs of migrant pupils, as a lack of suitable support means that establishing prior attainment levels is difficult. A case in point illustrated here is that "Migrant pupils tended to be in lowest-attaining groups and classes. Polish pupils often complained that they were not working at the right maths level". It is interesting to note, however, that the problem in this case is not described in terms of lack of EAL support, but in terms of lack of home language assessments and staff who could communicate in languages other than English. It is pointed out that "only Edinburgh had developed a number of assessments for children in their own languages" – in other words only one out of 32 Scottish local authorities had done so. In terms of language skills of staff, it is pointed out that "There was an over-reliance on English-as-an-additional-language

specialists, yet speakers of other languages could be as scarce as "hens' teeth". Children's neighbours sometimes had to be used as translators, which could compromise confidentiality".

3.3 Attitudes

The attitudes of education professionals towards the impact of EU migration on Scottish education are conveyed through quotations in each of the articles. The attitudes vary from recognition of the opportunity presented to frustration at the lack of resources for making the most of this. In Mcleod's article, the chief executive of the Association of Scotland's Colleges is quoted, saying that the increase in migrant students from new EU member states "'is both a challenge and an opportunity'". The challenge, as outlined above is the additional strain on resources, however the attitudes towards the presence of the students themselves in this article are extremely positive, as illustrated in a quotation from a spokesperson from Dundee College, one of the colleges cited as having had a large increase in the number of ESOL students: "'We have been delighted with the increase in numbers, particularly in Polish students. They seem to be able to find work and come to college to improve their English . . . We have found them to be hardworking and having a positive impact on the community. Without a doubt, the face of Dundee has changed dramatically in recent years - they have made it more cosmopolitan.'" This attitude expressed here echoes the findings by BEMIS referred to in the literature review of the Scottish media presenting migrants from Central and Eastern Europe as hardworking and making a positive contribution to Scottish society. Only in McLeod's article are attitudes towards migrants themselves expressed.

The views expressed in Seith's article have more to do with frustrations of school staff and teachers in dealing with the challenges presented by the increase in migration following EU enlargement. The head of Aberdeenshire's EAL service notes that "'People are getting agitated and would like more support, but there is no additional funding anywhere '". However, at the same time she recognises the right of the migrants and their children to live and participate in education in Scotland: "'These people from Eastern Europe have been actively recruited and sought by the Scottish government. I just wish that the First Minister had thought to increase the

budget to support them and their children at the same time'". The frustration expressed here is at the gap between the policy of the Scottish Executive to encourage inward migration to Scotland and the funding being made available to education services rather than at problems brought about by immigration.

This frustration is also expressed in Hepburn's article, which refers several times to "teachers feeling 'out of their depth'" in the face of increased numbers of migrant pupils from new EU countries. The lack of appropriate training is identified as part of the problem; it is written that "class teachers did not feel equipped to meet new arrivals' needs". There is also reference to some cultural differences that led to a perceived lack of engagement with education on the part of parents: "Moira Gray, headteacher at Ayr's Queen Margaret Academy, said that, despite using a Polish-English speaker, the school had not got Polish parents 'through the door'". The implicit assumption that was made here was that language was the main barrier preventing parents' engagement with the school, resulting in frustration when the "solution" was found to be ineffectual. Another head teacher mentions that "education was more separated from communities in some cultures; parents would be bemused if asked to come into school", illustrating the different expectations of schools in Scotland that migrant families may have. These quotations illustrate that more in-depth cultural awareness of Central and East European cultures is required if strategies for engaging the parents of migrant children in education are to be successful.

Although all of the new EU member states are mentioned by name in two out of the three articles, there was a tendency to take Poland and Polish migrants as representative of the group, with phrases like "new EU countries, such as Poland" used. This, whilst largely for stylistic purposes and possibly justifiable by the fact that Poles are the largest of the new member states, can create an idea that A8 migrants are a rather homogenous group, and does not convey the diversity of language and cultures within the group.

3.4 Summary

The discourse constructed in this small sample of media articles seeks to emphasise the large scale of EU migration to Scotland and in particular the increase in demand

for education services as a result. In all cases figures were used to illustrate this, but it is interesting to note that in referring more generally to the phenomenon of migration from A8 countries, the language used echoed that familiar from the tabloid press. This was particularly the case in MacLeod's article, with its repeated reference to "swathes" of migrants from Eastern Europe, but this article quotes the lowest actual numbers as it refers specifically to the further education sector. The other two articles use such language more sparingly. In all cases, the instances of the most dramatic increases in numbers of migrant pupils and students were highlighted in order to emphasise the impact of migration from A8 countries on Scottish education. However, it must be noted that in the articles by Hepburn and Seith, the somewhat hyperbolic terms used to describe the scale of A8 migration to Scotland were not employed in order to depict the numbers of migrants as a problem in itself – rather to contrast the demand for certain provisions with the lack of funding being made available for them. McLeod's article is more ambiguous in this respect, stressing the numbers of migrant students over the provision of services for them.

In each case, the capacity of the education system in Scotland to provide appropriate support for migrant pupils from A8 countries was called into question.   In further education, the Mcleod points to a lack of pastoral support; Seith and Hepburn's articles are more concerned with lack of EAL support in the primary and secondary sectors. Hepburn's article also emphasised the need for materials in pupils' home languages, as well as appropriate EAL support. The picture outlined across the three articles was of a struggle faced by education professionals to provide the standard of education that migrants are entitled to due to a lack of funding for specialised services. However, this appeared to be less of a problem in the FE sector, where increased student numbers meant an increase in funding for colleges.

One of the most interesting features of the articles was the discord between the slightly alarmist language used to describe the scale of migration and the strain on resources, and that used to illustrate the attitudes of teachers quoted. This is most stark in McLeod's article, where the "swathes" of migrants from Eastern Europe are in fact described in very positive terms. The inverse of this is seen in Seith's and Hepburn's articles, where the more moderate language used by the journalists is counter-balanced by quotations which clearly illustrate a frustrated workforce.

The next stage in this research is to investigate in depth the attitudes of teachers towards this issue, and whether their experiences reflect the discourse in the educational press.

Chapter 4

Interviews

The interview participants were all female and ranged in age from their early twenties to late thirties.   Their experience in education ranged from a student on a one year PGDE course up to fifteen years classroom experience.   For the purposes of confidentiality, they will be referred to simply by the letter "P" for "participant" followed by numbers 1, 2, 3, 4 &5 (see appendix 4 for information on the participants' sectors and roles).   Although the interviews were semi-structured in nature, I began each by asking the participants the first question on the interview schedule: "What do you feel are the main barriers to education faced by migrants from Central & Eastern Europe in Scotland?", and then followed with either questions from the schedule or related to their answers as deemed appropriate. Their responses in interviews were coded, which resulted in the following categories: *language, expectations, resources, training, culture & integration,* and *attitudes*.

4.1 Language

Language was, unsurprisingly, identified by 4 out of 5 participants as the main barrier faced by migrant pupils from A8 and A2 countries. This was in keeping with Sime's finding that "The most common difficulties [migrant children from Eastern Europe] encountered were related to language barriers" (2012: 7). However, the extent to which this was seen as a problem varied among those interviewed. P2 referred to her own experience as challenging, saying " . . . having taught Polish kids who had very little English, this was something that I found extremely difficult . . . you know, to communicate with them", whereas P1 said " . . . it's almost that the more languages you have in the class, the easier it is to teach, because that way you're using EAL strategies all of the time . . ."

P2 argued that many migrant pupils from A8 and A2 countries had covered very advanced material in subjects like Biology, but struggled with lessons and assessments because they were only available in English. She said that earlier in her career she had tried using translation software, such as Google Translate, to

translate materials, but soon stopped because of the ensuing hilarity among the pupils due to the poor quality of the translations. One school had adopted a compromise, in which a Polish speaking classroom assistant would take Polish students out of the classroom and attempt to cover the material as best he could, however, as P2 points out "Whilst he's very good and all that, he is not a teacher . . . he won't have the subject knowledge that someone with a degree in it would have, and he's also not had the teacher training" She found it difficult to relinquish control over supervising her students learning, as she saw this as ultimately her responsibility.

P4 also identifies language barriers as a problem for teachers, saying: "With 30 children in a class, with five different languages . . . it is extremely difficult to spend one-on-one time with the children who really need specifically designed input". Similarly to P2, she also pointed out issues with reliance on support staff: "learning support are often heavily relied upon, and while they do a fantastic job, extended time away from the class can lead to detachment from the school community, reduced socialisation, or children becoming dependant on one member of staff". This indicates a tension between the teachers' need for support and the consequences of providing it. Separation from peer groups is identified by the Roma Education Fund as one of the major barriers to education faced by Roma Pupils in Slovakia and the Czech Republic, and the UK education system is highly praised for its inclusive attitude toward Roma pupils, pointing out that they receive the same "English as an Additional Language (EAL) support, as did their recently arrived non-Roma peers of different national or ethnic backgrounds for whom English was a second language" (Roma Education Fund). However, if EAL support of pupils for whom English is a second language does involve "extended time away from the class", then is this not segregation by another name? That Roma pupils are treated the same as other migrant pupils emphasises that they in turn are treated differently from their non-migrant peers if they are frequently removed from the classroom to be taught by support assistants.

The issue of confidence and language was raised by P5, who saw language barriers as less of a problem due to her subject: " . . . in MFL there's so much focus on the target language, so it doesn't matter so much if they don't know English . . . but we still use English to check comprehension . . . if I ask someone else in the

class what a word is in English and they don't know what it is in French or English, then that's two words they don't know, and that's going to affect their confidence". Building confidence is a key feature of the Scottish Curriculum for Excellence, which cites creating "Confident Individuals" as one of its four Key aims (Education Scotland). P5 recognised that a language barrier could have a significant impact on this, and that despite her best efforts in the classroom the confidence of a migrant pupil could be knocked without her realising.

Related to the issue of confidence, P1 points to a mismatch between teachers' perspectives of migrant pupils' language skills and their actual level: "Sometimes you get a situation where a pupil with no English finally starts communicating fluently, then it's almost like the teacher assumes that they don't need the extra help anymore. But they do, their English isn't going to be like their skill in their own language and that's what they need, to have access to the curriculum." P3 mentioned a similar problem with students who had a good level of English, but still had trouble accessing all of the materials used in her classes – when she requested extra assistance, such as EAL classes, she was told that their English was "too good" and they didn't qualify for support.

Only one of the teachers, P3, had experience of successfully integrating the home languages of A8 migrant students into her history lessons – she had students read aloud the transcripts of radio broadcasts from WWII in their home languages. This not only helped their understanding of the subject, but as P3 points out "it showed the rest of the class that history is not only something that happened in English, that what happened in other places affects them too". This is an example of good practice which promotes "The development of respect for the child's parents, his or her own cultural identity, language and values" (UDHR 29:1 (c)), but P3 points out that it was only possible to do so in an FE context; because of timetabling pressure such enriching activities are harder to achieve in schools.

4.2 Expectations

When asked to describe the challenges EU migration from Central and Eastern Europe, P1 identified one problem that was also identified by Moskal – that Polish parents and Pupils perceived Scottish schools as "easier" than their Polish equivalents. She said "parents see their kids come to school and play . . . they think

that's what they're coming to school to do, just to play. It can be hard to explain to them, especially when there is a language barrier, that what looks like play is actually very carefully planned and structured, and that the children are actually learning through that. . ." This highlights a cultural difference in the expectations people from different countries have about the form and function of education. It is important to consider whether these differences could have an impact on children's learning, as it is conceivable that the perception of receiving a lower standard of education could impact negatively on engagement with school. This issue of differing expectations also underlines a failure to communicate the aims of the curriculum to parents and pupils; the official Education Scotland website is in English only, with occasional translations to Gaelic, which could be a barrier to parents of migrant pupils understanding the Scottish system.

4.3 Resources

Resources, or lack of, were identified as a major factor in the education of migrant pupils from Central and Eastern Europe. Lack of funding was one of the first things mentioned by all interviewees in response to the barriers to education EU migrant children faced, not just in terms of learning support and extra English language tuition, but in terms of books, dictionaries and consumable resources like worksheets.

P2 argued that "it's not just the lack of people talking to them that these kids suffer from . . . there's not even any dictionaries that they can use. Schools have lots for French, German, Spanish, Italian, but in my last school there was not one Polish dictionary despite the fact that 25% of the register in that school was Polish." P5 also pointed to the lack of resources designed for those whose first language is not English, saying "I mean it's all very well to talk about using target language or EFL strategies, but at the end of the day, if I have a kid from another country in one of my classes with no advance warning, what we need are resources I can use and know they will understand until I have time to work out their level and stuff."

Time was the major resource that teachers felt themselves to be lacking in. P2 said that "we could have worksheets and things translated, but the thing is, we just don't have *time*". This theme recurs throughout the interviews. P4 states that "Time is a huge challenge to all teachers, but especially to teachers who have a high

proportion of immigrant children in their class". Teaching migrant children was seen as something that should be a priority in terms of producing resources and planning lessons, but the implementation of the new Scottish curriculum, Curriculum for Excellence, was seen as an impediment to this. P2 said "With implementing the new curriculum, we're writing the coursework and assessments ourselves and this takes up most of the time . . . I think most of us would like to spend more time learning about the backgrounds of migrant pupils, even the languages, but there just isn't the time or the funding for it".

4.4 Training

Almost all of the interviewees felt that they were underprepared to give migrant pupils the education that they deserved, with the exception of P1, who had trained as a learning support teacher and has extensive experience of teaching English as a second language. P3 also mentioned her time as a classroom support assistant as the period where she received most input on working with migrant pupils, saying " . . . back then I had loads of training and felt quite confident that I could help. Then, after I started teacher training, just nothing . . ." The teachers all felt that the CPD (continuing professional development) provided by local authorities was *ad hoc* and didn't really meet their needs.

The trainees teachers interviewed felt especially underprepared P5 saying "any migrant children are going to be high on my list of priorities, but I don't always know if I'm doing the right things to help them learn" and P4 put it rather bluntly: " . . .although we have had some input on EAL children during my four years at university it does seem a bit tokenistic"

All teachers interviewed expressed willingness to undertake CPD to allow them to interact better with migrant pupils from Central & Eastern Europe. P4 thought that time set aside for teachers to learn even the basics of their pupils' home languages would be useful and help foster an inclusive environment. P2 said "I would love to start some CPD courses about language and culture and things like that – I'm aware that my understanding of Eastern Europe is very limited . . . but they don't exist. Anyway the schools I work in, because it comes out of their budget, don't like to spend money on training area cover, because I could be moved to a different school". P1 pointed to the need for specific training in this area: "one teacher in our

school didn't know what country one of her kids was from. She just knew he was "Eastern European". Such a lack of awareness and training needs to be tackled if teachers are to meet their obligations to migrant pupils. (Sime, P9)

4.5 Culture & Integration

Some of those interviewed raised the issue of cultural barriers that prevented migrant pupils from engaging with the curriculum. P3 said that "teaching British and Irish history is hard, because I tend to relate that to sectarianism in Glasgow . . . that can be a hard thing for them to get their heads around because they don't have any experience of it, so you need a different approach". P5 also argued that in the presence of pupils from different countries, Scottish pupils could become more protective of their own cultural identities "Some of the pupils I have taught, who see migrants maybe speaking in a Scottish way or something, get annoyed . . . they see it as their thing and don't want others 'copying' them. At the same time, others like it. It all depends on the personality"

When asked about cultural barriers to learning and integration, P2 said "no, I haven't really seen or experienced anything like that . . . it seems to me like it's all about the language barrier and once that's overcome the migrant kids seem to integrate really well.

On the issue of integration P3 had mixed experiences: "Well, in the college, certainly, the East Europeans stick together. In my class I have a Czech, a Pole and a Hungarian that are always together, but it's not like they have a common language" (Personality or Nationality?) On the other hand, in the secondary school she works in "there is a boy, I think he speaks Russian, and he's been teaching some of the other kids how to count to ten, so there's some mixing going on, it's not all one way". This is a small indicator of some of the *educational* benefits that migration and the presence of migrant pupils can bring to Scottish schools.

4.6 Attitudes

Negative attitudes from members of the community was one of the first barriers to education mentioned by P1; "There is a family of Eastern European migrants who have been told by some of parents not to bring their child to the school anymore because 'it's not one of us' . . . it's the sort of attitude you come across . . .so, yeah,

bit of a cultural barrier there, bit more of a racist barrier!". She also mentioned the tendency of staff in the school to see EU migrants as a homogenous group, citing the example of the teacher not knowing the nationality of one of her pupils.

The issue of social acceptance was also raised by P3, who said "I think things are getting better, but immigrants from Eastern Europe are still seen a bit negatively . . . I mean, the press don't help, y'know? The Daily Mails and all that lot . . . the refugees and asylum seekers are more accepted, people are more sympathetic towards them. There's still a lot of hostility towards Eastern Europeans." When asked if EU migration was a major challenge for Scottish schools, P4 responded "Yeah, I think so . . . not so much from experience, but from the media". P2 also expressed a second-hand perception of discrimination saying that "Fortunately in none of the schools I've worked in, but I know there exists, not so much towards the children, but prejudice about migrants in general"

4.8 Benefits

The teachers were unanimous that migration to Scotland from the new EU member states had the potential to have a positive impact on education. When asked to pinpoint what benefits it could bring, P1 responded "Ah, everything, there's everything good about it . . . kids are exposed to other languages and cultures from an early age. People in Scotland need to realise that there's a whole world out there and lots of those people have just as much right to live here as they do, especially in the smaller communities"

P4 argued that "Cultural diversity is incredibly important for Scottish schools. We live in a globalized world . . . if we want to maintain an international standing in the global economy, we must understand the countries and cultures we may be working with." She also mentioned the potential benefit to the local culture in Glasgow: "When children have the chance to experience different people, religious, cultures and ideas through migrant children this can help them develop their own ideas, reduce sectarianism and so on . . ."

The high standard of educational attainment among migrant pupils was also alluded to as having a positive influence on the school culture by P2, who said "their knowledge is leagues ahead of what we expect at that age . . . this can give other

pupils more motivation", while P1 pointed to the fact that "there is a work ethic among them which is . . . er . . . refreshing"

P3 noted that as a result of EU migration Scotland had become more cosmopolitan, and that the presence of "Polski Sklepy" and European food isles in supermarkets brought other cultures closer: "it's a lot easier now . . . to have cultural events. We've had a Polish history day, and a Czech and Slovak history day at the college . . . we were able to make it fun, because we could find 'typical' foods that the students could talk about and share. We also wanted to have vodka, but that wasn't allowed . . ." Although making a light-hearted comment here, P3 makes a serious point about the accessibility of the more mundane aspects of other cultures (like food and drink) being used as a tool in education to humanise the larger historical issues that the history days were based on.

4.9 Summary

Overall the teachers interviewed expressed a mixture of optimism about the opportunities presented to education by migration from Central and Eastern Europe, and frustration at their lack of ability to take advantage of these opportunities. The source of this frustration was mainly the lack of training and support and training to which they had access. Although some participants expressed awareness of negative attitudes, hostility or discrimination towards Eastern European migrants, there was only one concrete example alluded to.

Conclusions & Recommendations

This dissertation set out to explore both how the impact on education of migration to Scotland following the A8 and A2 EU enlargements is depicted in the educational media and how it is seen by teachers. In each case, a range of challenges were outlined, but were balanced by allusions to the positive impacts.

In the articles analysed, the *Times Educational Supplement Scotland*, using language that could be described as provocative, sought to draw attention to the pressure migration from Central and Eastern Europe put on education services by highlighting the scale of migration. In doing so, there was a tendency to focus on some of the more extreme or unexpected examples from rural areas that had seen the biggest increase in migration, but not necessarily the largest numbers. There was, however, an effort made to stress that the Scottish Executive was actively encouraging inward migration and that the problems lay in a lack of funding for support services, rather than the migrant students themselves. There was a particular focus on the provision of EAL services for which funding had not increased to meet rising demand.

The teachers interviewed perceived the challenges from EU migration rather differently. They saw increased migration as a chance for Scottish pupils to become familiar with other cultures and languages, but felt that a lack of training meant that they failed to make the most of this opportunity, which echoed Sime's finding that "Service providers often talked about difficulties in providing a good service for migrant families due to lack of resources, lack of information. . . and language and cultural barriers" (Sime 2010: 12). Participants also saw language barriers as the main obstacle that recent arrivals had to overcome, but acknowledged that there were issues of discrimination and cultural differences too.

The media and teachers presented different views on the solutions to the challenges presented by A8 and A2 migration, with the media calling for more EAL and bilingual support, while teachers wanted more training on how to deal with these challenges themselves and ready-made bilingual or translated resources. The perceived benefits also differed; the news articles tended to focus on the economic

benefits of the presence of migrant workers, whereas teachers saw a learning opportunity for all pupils. However, all were agreed that a lack of funding and resources exacerbated an already challenging situation.

The small scale of this study makes it difficult to make specific recommendations for policy and practice, but further research should be undertaken into what teachers see as the key resources that should be in place for supporting migrant pupils from Central and Eastern Europe to access the curriculum and integrate successfully into the school and the wider community.

For follow up research, it is suggested that a case study of a school which has a high proportion of its intake who are migrants from A8 and A2 countries would be a useful starting point from which to examine the specific strategies used and assess their effectiveness. If this could be replicated across a number of areas (both urban and rural) and local authorities, it would assist the development of a national strategy which would help establish equality in provision of education services for all. Such research is crucial to help ensure that Scottish schools can meet the standards laid down for them by the Education Scotland Act 2004, an obligation that will benefit all pupils - migrant or not.

List of References

Ackers, L 2004. A Community for Children?: Children, Citizenship and Internal Migration in the Eu (Research in Migration and Ethnic Relations). Edition. Ashgate Pub Ltd.

Barry, L (2011) "An act of educational vandalism" Migrants' Rights Network http://www.migrantsrights.org.uk/migration-pulse/2011/act-educational-vandalism [accessed 30 September 2012]

BEMIS (2011) "Public perception of A8 migrants: the discourse of the media and its impacts"
http://www.bemis.org.uk/resources/gt/scotland/learning_point_media_perceptions.pdf [accessed 17th December 2012]

Bryman, A (2008) Social Research Methods. 3 Edition. Oxford University Press, USA.

Council Directive on the education of the children of migrant workers (1977) OJ (L) 199

Council Directive 2004/38/EC on the right of citizens of the Union and their family members to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States (2004) OJ (L) 158/77

Croteau, David & Hoynes, William (1997) Media/Society: Industries, Images, and Audiences (London: Sage Publications Ltd)

Education Scotland (Additional Support for Learning) Act (2004)

Education Scotland Act (1980) c.44

Education Scotland website http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/ [accessed 2nd March 2013]

Hepburn, H (2009) "A Case of 'Sink or swim'" *Times Educational Supplement Scotland* http://www.tes.co.uk/article.aspx?storycode=6013517 [accessed 8th August 2012]

Kumari, A (2009) 'Teacher and Migrant Pupil Relationships: Implications in the Migrant Pupil UK School Experience' School of Education, The University of Birmingham

MacLeod, F (2006) "New Kids from the Bloc" *Times Educational Supplement Scotland* http://www.tes.co.uk/article.aspx?storycode=2291823 [accessed 8th August 2012]

Migrants' Rights Network (2011) "Employment & Migration in Scotland" http://www.migrantsrights.org.uk/files/MRN_Migration_and_Employment_Scotland.pdf [accessed 18 December 2012]

Moskal, M (2010) 'Polish migrant children's experiences of schooling and home-school relations in Scotland' CES briefing No. 54 http://www.ces.ed.ac.uk/PDF%20Files/Brief054.pdf [accessed 15 February 2012]

Regulation (EEC) No 1612/68 of the Council of 15 October 1968 on freedom of movement for workers within the Community http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=CELEX:31968R1612:EN:HTML [accessed 13 March 2012]

Reynolds, G (2008) 'The impact and experiences of migrant children in UK secondary schools.' Sussex Centre for Migration Research, vol 13 (2), pp 1-34

Roma Education Fund (2011) 'From Segregation to Inclusion: Roma Pupils in the United Kingdom A Pilot Research Project'

Speaking Out (2008) 'Rural migrant children, families and young people.' NCVCCO & NCVYS, vol 9, pp 1-34

Sbraggia, A & Stolfi, F (2008) 'Key Policies' The European Union: How does it work? Oxford. Oxford University Press.

Scottish Executive (2002) Report on the enlargement of the European Union and the challenges and opportunities facing Scotland http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2002/04/14542/3124 [accessed 13 November 2012]

Scottish Government (2009) Recent Migration to Scotland: the Evidence Base
http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2009/02/23154109/0 [accessed 21 March
2012]

Seith, E (2007) 'Language Support at Breaking point' *Times Educational Supplement
Scotland* http://www.tes.co.uk/article.aspx?storycode=2407209 [accessed 8 August
2012]

Sime, D, Fox, R & Pietka, E 2010, 'At home abroad: the life experiences of children
of migrant workers in Scotland'. University of Strathclyde.

Standards in Scotland's Schools Act (2000)

The Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (2010) OJ (C) 83/47

UN General Assembly, Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 10 December 1948,
217 A (III), http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/3ae6b3712c.html [accessed 7 March
2012]

United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989)

Zuleeg, F 2002 Benefits and threats of EU enlargement for Scotland. Scottish
Executive Economist Group.
http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/149166/0039652.pdf [accessed 13
November 2012]

Appendix 1
Plain Language Statement

University of Glasgow | College of Social Sciences

Plain Language Statement

1. Study title and Researcher Details Perceptions of the impact of migration since the 2004 EU enlargement on education in Scotland

<u>Researcher:</u>

Kirsten Anderson

Department of Central & East European Studies, University of Glasgow

2. Invitation paragraph

You are being invited to take part in a research study. Before you decide it is important for you to understand why the research is being done and what it will involve. Please take time to read the following information carefully and discuss it with others if you wish. Ask us if there is anything that is not clear or if you would like more information. Take time to decide whether or not you wish to take part. Thank you for reading this.

3. What is the purpose of the study?

The purpose of this study is to find out how teachers working in schools in Scotland see how migration from Central & Eastern Europe affects the provision of education services.

4. Why have I been chosen?

You have been chosen to take part in this study because you work in a school in Glasgow or the surrounding area.

5. Do I have to take part?

It is up to you to decide whether or not to take part. If you decide to take part you are still free to withdraw at any time and without giving a reason.

6. What will happen to me if I take part?

The research is to take place in December 2012 - January 2013. You will be invited to take part in an interview with the researcher. If you agree to this, you will be contacted to arrange a time and place for the interview that suits you. The interview will last between 20 minutes and half an hour.

7. Will my taking part in this study be kept confidential?

All information which is collected about you during the course of the research will be kept strictly confidential. You will be identified by an ID number and any information about you will have your name and other identifying information removed so that you cannot be recognised from it.

8. What will happen to the results of the research study?

The results of this study will be used to inform the researcher's undergraduate dissertation.

9. Who is organising and funding the research?

University of Glasgow Department of Central & East European Studies

10. Who has reviewed the study?

University of Glasgow College of Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee.

11. Contact for Further Information

Researcher: Kirsten Anderson

Email: 0801807a@student.gla.ac.uk

Supervisor: Dr Jan Čulík

Email: Jan.Culik@glasgow.ac.uk

Appendix 2

Interviewee Consent form

University of Glasgow | College of Social Sciences

Consent Form

Researcher: Kirsten Anderson

Project: Education, immigration, integration! Perceptions of the impact of migration since the 2004 EU enlargement on education in Scotland

1. I confirm that I have read and understand the Plain Language Statement for the above study and have had the opportunity to ask questions.

2. I understand that by signing this consent form I agree to being interviewed by the researcher and for the interview to be audio recorded.

3. I understand that the recording of the interview will be held by the researcher on a password protected computer until the dissertation for which the research is being conducted has been assessed after which time the files will be deleted.

4. I understand that my participation is voluntary and that I am free to withdraw at any time, without giving any reason.

5. I agree / do not agree (delete as applicable) to take part in the above study.

_____   _____   _____

Name of Participant   *Date*   *Signature*

_____   _____   _____

Researcher   *Date*   *Signature*

Appendix 3

Interview Guide

- What do you feel are the main barriers to education faced by migrants from Central & Eastern Europe in Scotland?

- What do you think are the main challenges faced by teachers and school staff as a result in migration from Central & Eastern Europe to Scotland?

- How do/would your expectations of migrant children from Central & Eastern Europe differ from those that you have for the rest of the pupils?

- Do you feel adequately prepared to teach migrant pupils from Central & Eastern Europe (in terms of training, resources and specialist support)?

- How well do you think migrants from Central & Eastern Europe integrate in the establishment you work in?

- What do you think is positive about the impact of migration from Central & Eastern Europe in Scottish schools?

Appendix 4

Interviewee Sample

In text reference	Sector	Role	Subject (if applicable)
1	Primary	Learning Support teacher	Learning Support
2	Secondary	Area Cover teacher	Science
3	Secondary (private) & Further Education	P/T Secondary teacher P/T FE lecturer	History
4	Primary	B ed. Student (4th year)	N/A
5	Secondary	PGDE student	Modern Foreign Languages (French & Spanish)